

#### Managing Pesticide Use to Protect Our Natural Environment

Ronald Parker, PhD Senior Environmental Engineer Office of Pesticide Programs US Environmental Protection Agency Washington DC

**3rd Latin American Pesticide Residue Workshop:** Food and Environment



#### Ecological Risk Assessment / Risk Management: Presentation Outline



- Ecological Risk Assessment (ERA): Why Do It? How Does It Work?
- Constraints to ERA Identified
- Possible Solutions Identified
  - Data Harmonization
  - Work-sharing
- Capacity-building; Capabilitytraining
- User-friendly Exposure/Risk Assessment Methods & Tools
- Overall Goal: Risk Management

# Ecological Risk Assessment: Why Do It?



Informs Pesticide Registration **Decisions** Informs Pesticide **Risk Management** Decisions Protects Wildlife Conserves Global **Biodiversity** Promotes Tourism

# Ecological Risk Assessment: How Does It Work?



Estimates the Likelihood of Adverse Ecological Effects by Comparing Estimated Field Exposure to Measured Laboratory Toxic Effects Data

Effects = Toxicity, hazard

May Be Combined With Human Health Risk Assessment & Pesticide Benefits Assessment for an Overall Pesticide Risk / Benefit Evaluation

#### **Ecological Risk Assessment Decision Diagram**



\* This diagram does not include human health risk assessment.



Five-Steps of Ecological Risk Assessment

- Step 1: Data Collection
- Step 2: Problem Formulation
- Step 3: Risk Analysis
- Step 4: Risk Characterization
- Step 5: Risk Management
- \*Based on USEPA *Guidelines for Ecological Risk* Assessment and EU Directive 91/414/EEC

## Step #1: Pesticide Data Collection



Develop and
 Assemble Data
 Needed for the Risk
 Assessment

- Laboratory Physical / Chemical Data
- Laboratory Ecological-Effects (Toxicity) Data
- Laboratory and Field
  Environmental Fate and
  Exposure Data

# **Types of Ecotoxicological Data**



- The Most Data is Available for: Birds, Small Mammals, Fishes, Insects, Crustaceans, Mollusks, Vascular Plants, Algae
- The Fewest Data are Available for: Reptiles, Amphibians, Sponges, Protozoans, Fungi, Worms, Coelenterates & Plant Groups

# Number of Species Tested



- World Has Identified More than 1.3 Million Animal & Plant Species
- For New Chemicals, We Have Acute Toxicity Data for About 15 Species
- For Older Chemicals –
  We Have Data For
  About 50 Species
- For Herbicides, We Have Data for About 15 Plant Species



# Use of Indicator (Surrogate) Species



- 2 3 Species of Bird Represent 9,000 Species of Birds and 6,500 Species of Reptiles
- 2 3 Species of Fish Represent 22,000 Species of Fish and 4,000 Species of Amphibians
- 3 4 Invertebrate Species Indicate Sensitivity of 1 Million Species of Invertebrates
- 15 Plant Species Indicate Sensitivity of the Plant Kingdom
- 1 -2 Insect Species Represent Over 800,000 Insects





Web-ICE (Interspecies Correlation Estimation) Toxicity Estimation Tool for Ecological Risk Assessment

Contact: Sandy Raimondo, Deborah Vivian, Jill Awkerman, and Mace Barron

USEPA/ORD/NHEERL/GED



#### How well do ICE models work? Model uncertainty related to taxonomic distance

Aquatics in same order ~ 90% within 5-fold, 95% within 10-fold

Common level	Number datapoints	5-fold	10-fold	50-fold	> 50 fold
genus (1)	372	92	3	4	1
family (2)	1042	92	6	2	0
order (3)	280	89	6	4	1
class (4)	5622	79	9	8	4
phylum (5)	854	52	17	21	10
kingdom (6)	4524	50	16	22	12

Percentage of all datapoints in cross-validation category

#### How well do ICE models work? Model uncertainty related to taxonomic distance

Wildlife in same order ~ 90% within 5-fold, 97% within 10-fold

#### Percentage of all datapoints in cross-validation category

Common level	Number datapoints	5-fold	10-fold	50-fold	> 50 fold
genus (1)	48	100	0	0	0
family (2)	1452	92	6	2	0
order (3)	2238	90	7	3	0.3
class (4)	5706	85	10	5	0.2
phylum (5)	2402	76	13	9	1.5

Raimondo et al. 2003 Environmental Science and Technology (ES&T)

## Data For Chronic Risk Assessment



- 2 Species of Birds, 1-2 Species of Crustacea, and 1-2 Species of Fish Are Used to Represent Chronic or Sublethal Sensitivity of All Species in these Groups
- Limited Number of Chronic Endpoints Are Statistically Analyzed Under Controlled Laboratory Conditions



## Acute-to-Chronic Estimation (with Time -Concentration - Effect Models)



# Step #2: Problem Formulation: Every Pesticide is Different



# Step #2: Problem Formulation



- Generates and Evaluates Hypotheses About Reasons that Ecological Effects of Human Activities May Occur
- Evaluates the Nature of the Problem, Refines Objectives for the Analysis and Provides the Foundation for the Assessment.
- Develops a Plan For Analyzing Data and Characterizing Risk
- Responds to the Needs of the Risk Manager

## Step #3: Ecological Risk Analysis (1)



- Connects Problem Formulation
  Phase (Step 2) With the Risk
  Chacterization Phase (Step 4)
- Examines the Relationships Between the Two Primary Components of Risk, *Exposure* & *Effects*, and Between Them and Ecosystem Characteristics
- Provides the Ingredients
  Necessary for Estimating
  Ecological Responses to
  Pesticides Under Exposure
  Conditions of Interest

# Step #3: Ecological Risk Analysis (2)



- Assessment Endpoints and Conceptual Models Developed During Problem Formulation Provide the Focus and Structure for the Analyses
- Develops Summary Profiles that Describe Exposure and the Relationship between the Pesticide (Stressor) and its Effects (Response)
- These Profiles Provide the Basis for Estimating and Characterizing Risk

# Aquatic Ecological Risk Analysis



- Explicitly Assesses Fish and Invertebrates
- Implicitly Assesses Amphibians, Molluscs, etc
- Assesses Both Freshwater Organisms and Salt Water / Estuarine Organisms
- Always Assesses Direct Effects
- Sometimes Also Assesses
  Indirect Effects (e.g. Fish Food, Habitat, Predators, etc)
- Most Difficult Type of Exposure Assessment – Due to Inherent Variability of Aquatic Habitat

## **Terrestrial Ecological Risk Analysis**



- Explicitly Assesses Birds and Mammals
- Implicitly Assesses Reptiles
- Always Assesses Direct Effects
- Sometimes Also
  Assesses Indirect Effects (e.g., Availability of Food, Habitat, Predators, etc)
- Much Easier than Aquatic Exposure Assessment

## Step #4: Ecological Risk Characterization



- Risk Assessors Use Results of the Analysis Phase (*Exposure and Effects*) to Develop an Estimate of the Risks Faced by Animal and Plant Populations and Communities
- Allows Risk Assessors to Clarify the Relationships Between Pesticide Effects and Ecological Communities and to Reach Conclusions Regarding the Occurrence of Exposure and the Potential to See Adverse Effects
- Assessor Identifies and Summarizes the Uncertainties, Assumptions and Qualifiers in the Risk Assessment
- Reports the Conclusions to Risk Managers to Provide Clear Information for Environmental Decision Making

## Step #5: Ecological Risk Management: Possible Mitigation Measures



- Mitigation Measures Tailored to Local Conditions (e.g., Weather Limitations, Soil Type Limitations With Regard to Runoff, Sensitive Site Limitations)
- Pesticide Use Restrictions (Reduction In Application Rate and Number of Applications, Increased Time Between Applications, Acreage Limitation, Limits on Application Method, Requirement For Incorporation Into Soil)
- Separation Buffer Zones to Reduce Spray Drift to Vulnerable Sites
- Physical Barriers Such as Trees Along Waterways to Intercept Spray Drift
- Using No-tillage or Reduced Tillage Agriculture to Reduce Runoff and Soil Erosion

## Step #5: Ecological Risk Management: Possible Mitigation Measures



- Vegetated Buffer Zones to Reduce Offsite Runoff of Pesticide to Vulnerable Sites
- Use of Constructed Wetlands and Holding Ponds to Provide Time for the Pesticide to Degrade
- Application Restrictions (e.g., Method Type - Aerial Versus Ground, Field Tarps, Soil Compaction, Timing of Application)
- Equipment Cleaning and Maintenance Helps to Assure that the Target Application Rate Is the Rate that Is Actually Applied
- Restrictions on Locations at Which Equipment May Be Cleaned (Away From Waterways and Wells)
- Safe Disposal of Excess Product

# Load Reduction for Field Buffers: Dissolved Pesticide



# Load Reduction for Field Buffers: Adsorbed Pesticide





#### Making Ecological Risk Assessment Work: Addressing Major Constraints



#### Ecological Risk Assessment: Constraints Identified in Central American Workshop



Need For Better Coordination Among Ministries Within the Country and Between other Countries in the Region

- Short Legal Time-Frame for Collecting Data and Conducting Ecological Risk Assessment
- Inadequate Resources (Funding, Trained Staff, Laboratory Facilities)



#### Risk Assessment Constraints Identified by Latin American Regulators





- Limited Data on Local Non-Target Species Which May Need Protection
- Environment Fate and Toxicity Data that were Developed for Temperate Climates & Species
- Lack of Data For Exposure Assessment (Crops, Soil Properties, Water Resources, Weather History, etc)



### **Risk Assessment is Scientifically Complex**



 ERA Requires Many Scientific Disciplines
 Agronomy, Botany, Entomology, Ecology, Bacteriology, Toxicology, Public Health, Chemistry,

Public Health, Chemistry, Hydrology, Environmental & Agricultural Engineering, Crop Production, Farm Management, Economics, Statistics, Geology, Zoology, etc.

 ERA Requires Strong Management & Coordination Skills

#### Development of Ecological Risk Assessment – Risk Management Training Module (eVALUATE)



- OECD Working Group on Pesticides (WGP): International Pesticide Assessment Consultation
  - Held in Washington, DC in October 1998
  - Hosted by the USEPA Office of Pesticide Programs and the National Chemicals Inspectorate of Sweden
  - OECD, Non-OECD, NGOs: UN
    Organizations, Pesticide Industry
- Requests by Latin American Countries to USEPA/OPP for Training in Risk Assessment Methods



#### Funding and Technical Support for eVALUATE



- Partially Provided by USEPA
  Field and External Affairs Division
- Partially Provided by IUPAC Division of Chemistry and the Environment
- Technical Support Provided by OPP EFED, Members of IUPAC Division of Chemistry and Environment & Industry Scientists
- Cooperation & Support from:
  - Joint International Atomic Energy Agency-Food and Agriculture Organization (IAEA-FAO) Pesticide Program
  - International Food Contaminant and Residue Information System (INFOCRIS) Pesticide "Distance Learning for Capacity-Building" (e-Learning) Website



## **Original OECD WGP Recommendations**



- Provide Access to Examples of Completed Risk Assessments
- Encourage Harmonization, Work-sharing & Membership in Regional Groups
- Create a "Layman's Guide" to the OECD Monograph Guidance Documents
- Standardize Definitions for Risk Assessment Vocabulary and Processes
- Identify Useful Sites on the World Wide Web

# **OECD WGP Recommendations**



- Assist in Technology Transfer of Risk Assessment Methods & Tools
  - Provide Access to Tools for
    Estimating Pesticide
    Exposure
  - Provide Access to Tools for
    Estimating Pesticide
    Toxicity
- Encourage Participation in International Groups and Treaties (IFCS, PIC, POPS, IPCS, Montreal Protocol)

# **OECD WGP Recommendations**



- OECD Should: Consider Ways in Which Data Developed for Temperate Climates Could be Adapted to Meet the Needs of Developing Countries with Arid & Tropical Climates
- Pesticide Industry Should:
  - Consider Ways to Facilitate the Flow of Information from Agencies in Developed Countries to those in Developing Countries
  - Assist and Encourage National Regulatory Agencies in the Development and Adoption of a Common Data Submission Format

## Benefits of Work-sharing and of Harmonized Methods and Testing



Work-sharing Among Countries

- Harmonization
  - Common Test Guidelines
  - Joint Data Development
  - Common Assessment Methods
- Joint Data Review
  - Reduces Costs
  - Increases Range of
    Expertise Available
  - Saves Time



### **Regional Harmonized Assessment Groups**



- European Union (EU)
- North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) Countries
- Organizational For Economic Cooperation And Development (OECD) Countries
- Andean Community Countries
- Central American Countries:
  Central American Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA)
  - Organismo Internacional Regional de Sanidad Agropecuaria (OIRSA)
- West African Countries: Comité Sahelien Des Pesticides (CSP) – the Regional Registration Authority
- Southern African Development Community (SADC) Countries
- MERCOSUR Countries (possible)

## Components of e-VALUATE Pesticide Risk Assessment & Training Module



- Step-by-Step Guidance
- Risk Assessment
  Process Diagram
- Risk Management
  Guidance
- Glossary of Terms & Process Descriptions
- Environmental Fate and Toxicity Databases
- Training Materials
- Exposure Models
- Internet Linkages

#### User-friendly, Harmonized Aquatic and Terrestrial Exposure Models



- EXPRESS (EXAMS PRZM Exposure Simulation Shell): User-friendly, Input/Output Shell to Estimate Pesticide Exposure to Aquatic Wildlife Using More Complex, Sophisticated Models
- T-REX (Terrestrial Residue Exposure) Model Is a More Complex, Spreadsheet-based Estimator of Terrestrial Ecological Risk Also Based on Potential Pesticide Residues on Avian and Mammalian Food Items Using the Fletcher-Kenaga (UTAB) Data Base, and
- RICE Models: Pesticide Environmental Fate and Transport, Water Quality Model that Estimates Pesticide Concentrations Within and Down-steam From Single or Multiple Rice Paddies.

# EXPRESS (EXAMS - PRZM Exposure Simulation Shell)



- EXPRESS (<u>EXAMS PRZM</u> <u>Exposure Simulation Shell</u>) Is a User-friendly, Input/Output Shell to Estimate Pesticide Exposure to Aquatic Wildlife Using Much More Complex and Sophisticated Models
- Simulations Using the Pesticide Root Zone Model (PRZM) and Exposure Analysis Modeling System (EXAMS) Are Used For a "Refined" Estimation of Pesticide Concentrations In Surface Waters Used as Drinking Water Sources and for Aquatic Ecosystem Exposure Assessments.

#### T-REX (Terrestrial-Residue EXposure) Model for Avian / Mammalian Exposure Assessment



Note: Sources of wildlife diet are assumed to be available for less than one year for this model.

- T-REX (Terrestrial Residue Exposure) Model Is a Spreadsheetbased Estimator of Terrestrial Ecological Risk
- Not Site or Region (or Country) – specific
- Based on Potential Pesticide Residues on Avian - Mammalian Food Items Using the Fletcher-Kenaga Database



## Additional Work on eVALUATE Still Needed



- Complete Translation into Spanish, Portuguese and other Languages
- Develop HTML Versions for the Internet
- Develop Crop-specific EXPRESS Scenarios
- Coordinate Module, Models, Manuals, and Materials with other Organizations
- Conduct National and Regional Training Workshops In Use of the Module